Check for

updates

# Improving the Performance Indicators of Nursing Students in the Field: Regular Review of Studies

Mehrdad Esmaeili <sup>1</sup> , Abbas Toloie Eshlaghy <sup>2,\*</sup> Mohammadali Afshar Kazemi <sup>3</sup>, Mohammadreza Motadel <sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Department of Technology Management, Central Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran. Iran.

<sup>2</sup> Department of Industrial Management, Faculty of Economics and Management, Islamic Azad University, Science and Research Branch, Tehran, Iran

<sup>3</sup> Department of Industrial Management, Central Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

\*Corresponding author: Abbas Toloie Eshlaghy, Department of Industrial Management, Faculty of Economics and Management, Islamic Azad University, Science and Research Branch, Tehran, Iran. E-mail: toloie@gmail.com

DOI: 10.29252/anm-290403

Submitted: 30-06-2020	Abstract
Accepted: 14-07-2020	Introduction: Nursing is one of the most important disciplines in the field of medical
Published: 28-05-2021	sciences, and its graduates are expected to have sufficient knowledge, skills, attitudes
<b>Keywords:</b> Nursing Students Review Article Skill	• and motivation in caring for patients. Internship or clinical training is the most important part of nursing education and clinical practice is a key component of the nursing curriculum to acquire essential skills. In this study we aim of determining the indicators of performance improvement, internships in the field of nursing students were conducted.
© 2020. Advances in Nursing and Midwifery	<b>Methods:</b> The present study was performed by Garard's regular review method. Sample research from the study of texts, sources and related articles between 2012-
How to cite: Esmaeili M, Toloie Eshlaghy A, Afshar Kazemi M, Motadel M. Improving the Performance Indicators of Nursing Students in the Field: Regular Review of Studies. <i>Adv Nurs Midwifery</i> . 2020;29(4):3-7. doi: 10.29252/anm-290403	<ul> <li>2020 which are in English and Persian and in the databases of Medline, Pro Quest CINAHL, Web of Science, Elsevier, Google Scholar, and Iranmedex with Persian keywords indicators of improvement, performance Clinical function, nursing students and English keywords Improvement Clinical function, Indicator, Nursing Students Search 53 53 related studies were found, 23 sources were omitted due to lack of full text of the articles.</li> <li><b>Results:</b> In the study of the obtained findings, according to the aim of improving the performance of nursing students, 32 studies were performed and are summarized.</li> <li><b>Conclusions:</b> Nursing students in the field should have all the principles of care and practice of an expert nurse, which indicates insufficient performance and less than the standard of students.</li> </ul>

### **INTRODUCTION**

Nursing is one of the most important disciplines in the field of medical sciences, and its graduates are expected to have sufficient knowledge, skills, attitudes and motivation in caring for patients. Internship or clinical training is the most important part of nursing education and clinical practice is a key component of the nursing curriculum to acquire essential skills [1]. The purpose of the internship is to acquire skills in performing the tasks given in the nurse job description. Skills in performing nursing care require full-time, complete and regular presence in the field and providing independent and semi-independent services in order to acquire specialized skills. Therefore, identifying the key

dimensions and main indicators of undergraduate nursing students' performance is of particular importance. But the complexity of learning in a clinical setting has caused [2]. Applying performance appraisal is the most effective way to improve the quality of education and student performance.

Clinical performance appraisal provides data to judge nursing students 'achievement of desired learning outcomes and judges students' skills in relation to patient care standards. Acceptable clinical practice includes knowledge, attitudes, and skills that are gradually developed in the student in clinical settings.

Copyright © 2020 The Author(s); Published by Advances in Nursing and Midwifery. This is an open access article, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses /by-nc/4.0/) which permits others to copy and redistribute material just in noncommercial usages, provided the original work is properly cited.

The final outcome of clinical performance evaluation is to ensure that quality and safe care is provided [3].

Despite the importance of evaluation, especially clinical evaluation, this issue still remains a mental problem, time consuming and confusing so that most educators and students are not satisfied with the clinical evaluation method and the indicators are not clear and transparent [4]. As the results of the study of Mohammadi et al. In 2011 showed that 90% of nursing students in the 6th, 7th, 8th semesters believe that the evaluation of students' performance is not done according to transparent indicators and 62% said that what should not be evaluated should be evaluated. 95% did not consider the current methods to be sufficient to assess clinical skills and the assessment conditions are not the same for all students [5].

Students participating in the qualitative study of Kalman et al. Claim that assessment tools payvery little attention to functional skills, and students exercise their ability to perform national skills [3]. An effective education and evaluation system is a system that stimulates the creativity of individuals and assesses the abilities of individuals according to individual differences. Recognize students' mistakes to themselves, encourage learners to discuss and think critically, and increase their self-confidence [6]. It also gives learners the opportunity to make informed decisions and document personal experiences and correct mistakes, and to encourage inclusive participation and support for the goals of the curriculum and appropriate teacher-learner communication. The results of a study by Coffey 2015 et al., Which examined the application and evaluation of nursing students by the logbook in clinical development, showed that the logbook is a useful educational and communication tool that provides the necessary guidance to achieve maximum learning opportunities [7, 8]. But improved instructions are needed. In another study in this field, the lack of clear instructions on filling in the content of the logbook has been considered as one of the reasons for students' dissatisfaction and many ways to improve the process have been considered necessary. Although the use of logbooks has many applications in medical education, more research is needed in the field of nursing and midwifery [9]. In the study of Heydari et al., Using a logbook led to familiarizing students with learning tasks and objectives, targeting students' efforts to learn assigned tasks, targeting professors' efforts to educate students, creating an educational interaction between teacher and learner, and documenting students' practical activities [10]. Considering the large number of nursing students and the need for their skills training as internships in the field of this study, with the aim of determining the indicators

of performance improvement, internships in the field of nursing students were conducted.

#### METHODS

The present study was performed by Garard's regular review method. Sample research from the study of texts, sources and related articles between 2012-2020 which are in English and Persian and in the databases of Medline, Pro Quest CINAHL, Web of Science, Elsevier, Google Scholar, and Iranmedex with Persian keywords indicators of improvement, performance Clinical function, nursing students and English keywords Improvement Clinical function, Indicator, Nursing Students Search 53 53 related studies were found, 23 sources were omitted due to lack of full text of the articles. 12 articles due to lack of complete criteria including lack of specification Existence of goals and incomplete results were eliminated. At the end, 18 articles were reviewed.

Garrard method is a regular method to review the results of other research findings. First, articles or experimental sources related to the concepts were collected, then according to Garrard's general principles in terms of goals, type of research, research method, tools, how to collect data. And results were evaluated. Studies were selected if they met the desired conditions and were used in the regular review process. Then, in order to achieve the findings of the researcher, the selected studies were summarized in a table similar to Table 1, and in the second stage, they were removed and finally the concept of performance improvement was studied and determined.

### RESULTS

In the study of the obtained findings, according to the aim of improving the performance of nursing students, 32 studies were performed and are summarized in Table 1.

# 360-degree evaluation (feedback) (in relation to evaluators)

Performance appraisal was previously limited to the feedback process between the individual and his / her superiors. But with increasing focus on teamwork, staff promotion, and customer service, the emphasis has been on feedback from a variety of sources. The multi-input method of performance appraisal is sometimes called 360-degree appraisal to visualize a complete circle (sphere). Research has shown that this method provides accurate and reliable information. The sources of feedback in the circle include supervisors, colleagues, subordinates, service consumers, and the individual. Of course, it should be noted that getting feedback from all the resources in a particular program is not always necessary or appropriate. Instead, conditions should be

**Copyright** © 2020 The Author(s); Published by Advances in Nursing and Midwifery. This is an open access article, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses /by-nc/4.0/) which permits others to copy and redistribute material just in noncommercial usages, provided the original work is properly cited.

considered in the selection of sources, including the following.

Organization culture and mission, paying attention to the difference in the purpose of getting feedback from each source, performance evaluation goals, and specific aspects of performance under study [11].

Figure 1. Review of regular reviews of clinical performance improvement studies for nursing students

In medicine, this method is also suggested and used in the evaluation of residents. Evaluation resources in this area include teachers, classmates, patients, the individual, and other professional staff [12].

Improvement Clinical function, Indicator, Nursing Students 53 related studies were found that 23 sources were Medline •Pro excluded due to the unavailability of the full text of the Quest CINAHL articles. 12 articles were deleted due to the lack of Identification and Web of Science complete criteria, including unclear objectives and review 'Elsevier 'Google incomplete results. At the end, 18 articles were Scholar. reviewed. Articles evaluated: objectives, research method, Qualification sampling, research environment and results were conditions reviewed Articles were reviewed and tabbed by Garrard Assessment Results method Table 1. Regular review analysis available Indicators of improving the clinical performance of Domains nursing students in the field Carrying out care based on knowledge and standards, using evidence-based Applying knowledge and skills resources to make decisions and generate information

	Client study, Client care program, Knowledge application, Education, Caring,	
Professional performance standards and accountability	Responsibility, professional behavior, performance improvement and review and	
	intervention skills	
Communication and skills in relationships / human care	Respect for the culture of others, Patient advocacy, Patient-centered care, Ethics,	
and dignity	Privacy, Confidentiality	
safety		
Give medicine	Calculate: enter data, search for resources, communicate with other caregivers through the network	
Nursing process	Speech: Interact, Listen, Get History, Report to Other Caregivers, Write Conversation: Record, Report, Analyze, Do Written Assignments	
Care standard	Judgment, Motivation, Psychomotor Skills, Teaching / Learning, Development,	
Professional role development, education, performance	Crisis and Client Care, Communication Survey, Diagnosis, Care Plan, Expected	
review, ethics, resource use / collaboration, care quality research	Outcome, Execution, Evaluation	
Critical Thinking, Communication, Review and	Use of evidence in practice, application of theory in practice, problem solving,	
Analysis, Planning, Execution, Evaluation, Role	decision making, scientific study	
Expansion		
Management skills	Planning, coordinating the work of others, using human resources and equipment, working group	
Leadership skills	Collaborate, build alliances, conscious risk-taking, make suggestions, professional	
	accountability and continuous improvement	
Evaluation feedback	Comprehensive assessment and the role of learning in assessment	
Training skills	Saying, showing and showing health care, teaching others, guiding	

**Copyright** © 2020 The Author(s); Published by Advances in Nursing and Midwifery. This is an open access article, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses /by-nc/4.0/) which permits others to copy and redistribute material just in noncommercial usages, provided the original work is properly cited.

14

No.	Skill	Number of phrases
1	Professional behavior	2 to 6
2	Communication	0 to 5
3	Complete nursing process	Only in one group
4	Educate the Student / family	0 to 3
5	Reporting	1 to 5
6	Student Safety	0 to 3
7	Prevention of infection	0 to 2
8	Giving medicine and serum	0 to 4
9	Patient feeding	0 to 2
10	Hospitalized patient	0 to 1
11	Patient Discharge	0 to 1
12	Specialized phrases section	0 to 6

## Model of competency outcomes and review of Lennberg performance in relation to planning and evaluation strategies

The model of competency outcomes and performance review of Lenberg et al. (Copa) has been designed and organized as a framework for promoting performance competency, based on a philosophy based on competency and performance-oriented outcomes and methods [13]. This model is applied at all levels of education, all clinical courses and competencies in different degrees and is organized around four basic conceptual axes: main competencies of performance, final outcomes of competency, interactive learning strategies and Performance-driven [14].

Purposeful and objective studies of performance competence in the Copa model. Competency Outcome Performance Assessment (COPA) Once the key performance competencies have been identified, the final results are organized based on the expectations of the course. After that, the content and main skills of the course are determined based on the final results of the performance competencies and then the various interactive learning strategies are determined. Finally, decisions are made about objective performance assessment methods that are an effective guide for continuous evaluation and quality improvement during the training course [15].

# Collaborative model of clinical education in relation to evaluators and clinical evaluation program

In the clinical education partner model, the clinical nurse and the instructor cooperate in teaching a certain number of students. The clinical nurse is responsible for educating students and acts as a source and role model for students. The instructor also has a supervisory and educational role. Decisions about clinical experiences and assignments are made jointly to varying degrees, and student evaluation is usually done jointly. For this model to be used successfully, clinical settings must be receptive and supportive of its philosophy and application. On the other hand, preparing clinical nurses to play this role through the implementation of educational programs and familiarity with the student education process and provide the opportunity to increase their knowledge, especially by the faculty is essential [14].

In the section of reviewing the obtained information texts, several factors in evaluating the performance of nursing students, including communication and human skills, professional skills and critical thinking, ethics were introduced, which in combination with the qualitative part could be helpful in presenting the general model [16].

### DISCUSSION

Nursing students in the field should have all the principles of care and practice of an expert nurse [17], which indicates insufficient performance and less than the standard of students. They face problems so that their improper performance causes dissatisfaction of patients, colleagues and physicians [13]. In the study of Del Aram et al. It has created a job so that many graduates leave the service at the beginning and are reluctant to return to work. The inability of new graduates can cause irreparable consequences in the health care system that puts the greatest risk on the patient and the community [8].

#### REFERENCES

- Imanipour M, Jalili M. Nursing Students' clinical Evaluation In Students and Teachers Views. Iranian Journal of Nursing Research. 2012;7(25):17-26.
- Latifi M, Shaban M, Nikbakht Nasrabadi A, Mehran A, Parsa Yekta Z. Effect of clinical evaluation with portfolio on critical thinking skills of nursing students. Iranian Journal of Medical Education. 2011;11(4):368-81.
- Dos Santos JLG, Pestana AL, Guerrero P, Klock P, Erdmann AL. Logbook: experience of teaching-learning management and management in nursing and health. Northeast Network Nursing Journal. 2013;14(4):854-63.
- Sardari M, Esmaeili R, Ravesh NN, Nasiri M. The impact of pressure ulcer training program on nurses' performance. Journal of Advanced Pharmacy Education & Research | Jul-Sep. 2019;9(3).
- Mohammadi M, Naseri Jahromi R, Moeini Shahraki H, Mehrabanian N. Internal efficiency and external effectiveness of medical-vocational doctoral curriculum from the

**Copyright** © 2020 The Author(s); Published by Advances in Nursing and Midwifery. This is an open access article, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses /by-nc/4.0/) which permits others to copy and redistribute material just in noncommercial usages, provided the original work is properly cited.

perspective of students, graduates, and faculty members of Shahid Sadooghi University of Medical Sciences, Yazd. Iranian Journal of Medical Education. 2003;3(13):233-43.

- Boswell C, Cannon S. Introduction to Nursing Research, Incorporating Evidence-Based Practice. Boston: Jones and Bartlett Publisher; 2007.
- Cooper B, Gargan A. Rubrics in an education-old term, new meanings 2009 [updated 2021; cited 2021]. Available from: http://facultycenter.ischool.syr.edu/files/2012/02/Rubricsi Education2.pdf.
- Delaram M. The status of clinical education from the perspective of nursing and midwifery students of Shahrekord University of Medical Sciences. Iranian Journal of Medical Education. 2006;6(2):129-35.
- Lotfi M, Zamanzadeh V, Abdollahzadeh F, Seyyed RA, Jabbarzadeh F. The effect of using logbook on nursing students learning in gynecology wards. Tabriz Nursing and Midwifery Journal 2010;19:33-8.
- Heidari H, Akbari N. Developing and Implementing Log Book in Teaching Principles and Techniques to Nursing and Midwifery Students: Mixed Method Study. Future of Medical Education Journal. 2017;7(1):14-8.
- 11. Asadizaker M, Abedsaeedi Z, Abedi H, Alijanirenani H, Moradi M, Jahani S. Improvement of the first training for baccalaureate

nursing students-a mutual approach. Global journal of health science. 2015;7(7):79-92.

- Yaghobian M, Fakhri M, Salmeh F, Yaghobi T, Zakizad M, Shahmohammadi S. Assessment of the effect of log book on nursing and midwifery students' clinical skills. Middle-East Journal of Scientific Research. 2011;7(6):896-902.
- Tahernejad K, Javidan F. Advanced Evaluation of Clinical Practice of Medical Students: Challenges, Methods, Approaches. Journal of Developmental Steps in Medical Education. 2008;5(1):58-70.
- Billings DM, Halstead JA. Teaching in Nursing: A Guide for Faculty. 3rd ed: St. Louis, Saunders-Elsevier; 2009.
- Blake TK. Journaling; An active learning technique. International Journal of Nursing Education Scholarship. 2005;2(1).
- Kiarsipour N, Borhani F, Esmaeili R, Zayeri F. The correlation of aging perceptions and life satisfaction in Iranian older adults. Annals of Tropical Medicine and Public Health. 2017;10(4):861.
- Seldomridge LA, Walsh CM. Evaluating student performance in undergraduate preceptorships. Journal of Nursing Education. 2006;45(5):169-76.

**Copyright** © 2020 The Author(s); Published by Advances in Nursing and Midwifery. This is an open access article, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses /by-nc/4.0/) which permits others to copy and redistribute material just in noncommercial usages, provided the original work is properly cited.